

CS 4001 Term Paper Draft Peer Review

You will be given a printout of a term paper from another student in class. Take it home and read it, writing comments on the paper when you have them. Specific things to write down on the paper include:

- You should indicate any place you do not understand what the person is trying to say with a question mark or “huh?” notation.
- Any place where you don't believe a claim, you should state so. (“I doubt!”)
- Any place where a claim may be true, but you are not 100% convinced, you should write “more evidence!”
- Any time they make an assumption that isn't backed up with evidence, you should call them on it and label the assumption.

In addition to the specific items above, while reading you should think about the overall claim of the paper, the organization of arguments, quality of their references, and how well they laid the groundwork (background) so that you could understand their topic area.

When reading, it may help you to keep these questions in mind:

1. Is the claim clear?
2. Is the organization of the argument rational?
2. Does the claim and its supporting arguments have evidence to back them up?
3. Are counterarguments fairly presented and addressed?
5. Is sufficient background given to explain issues to the target audience?
6. Are sources of appropriate “weight” and are their enough of them to support the claims?

Your assignment

In addition to the standard name/email boilerplate that you place at the top of every assignment, this submission must include:

1. The author's name and the topic of the paper you reviewed.
2. Three specific things that should be improved about the paper, and your suggestion as to how to do so. (You may refer to the notations you made in the paper itself above, but you should also try and provide advice as to how to improve the issue.)
3. Your best guess as to the grade that this draft will receive from the instructor(s) when they grade it, and which categories will receive Excellent, Satisfactory, (or less) scores (Refer to the CS 4001 Draft Term Paper Grading Key posted on the class website for the grading categories.)
4. Suggestions on the general approach to the topic and/or argument structure that could be improved to make the argument in the paper stronger.

Turn in a PDF of your paper to T-Square, and also bring a printout to class to return to the author of your paper, along with the marked up paper.